

School Building Assistance Committee

Meeting October 4, 2012

Joint Committee Meeting with the School Committee

School Bldg. Asst. Committee Members: <u>Present</u>	School Committee Members: <u>Present</u>	Also Present
Dave Dockendorf, Co-Chair MaryLou Osborne, Co-Chair Karin Chavis Gail Conlon, H.S. Principal Robert DiMento Arthur Marcella Anthony Evangelista Barbara Flavin Monica Ford, Town Treasurer Martha Kelleher, M.S. Principal Richard Lawton John Macero, Superintendent Jim McKenna, Town Manager <u>Absent</u> Dottie Donofrio, David Girard Jim Letterie Debi McDonald Vinnny Crossman Gerald Boyle	Gary Skomro, Chair MaryAlice Sharkey Brian Perrin Peter Gill, Town Council President Todd Sacco <u>Absent:</u> William Holden Melissa Polino	George Metzger, HMFH Tina Stanislaski, HMFH Mike Morrison, Skanska Frank Daloia, Citizen Craig Mael, Town Council

Please note: Gary Skomro is a member of both committees but only listed for attendance purposes under School Committee

Dave Dockendorf called the meeting to order

Gary Skomro asked that Patti Hames, Secretary for the School Committee to have roll call for attendance.

Dave Dockendorf confirmed that a quorum of the School Building Assistance Committee was present

Pledge of Allegiance

Gary Skomro accepted a motion to approve School Committee Minutes of the Special Joint Meeting Minutes from September 20, 2012 by Mr. Gill

Second by Ms. Sharkey

No Discussion

Vote: Unanimous

Motion by Barbara Flavin to approve the School Building Assistance Committee minutes of September 6 and September 20, 2012

Second by Karin Chavis

No Discussion

Vote: Unanimous

Financial:

Motion to Approve Invoices: from HMFH Architects Inc. #997415, #997416, and #997417 which were emailed to the committee with backup for review

Total: \$36,254.73

Motion by Mary Lou Osborne

Second by Karin Chavis

No Discussion

Vote: Unanimous

Agenda Items:

Space Summary:

Tina Stanislaski from HMFH Architects explained the various proposed space summary charts.

Mary Lou Osborne thanked everyone for their input reminding them that it is the educational plan that drives the project, which is what MSBA looks at.

A handout: "Winthrop High School Building Project and Proposed Space Summary" was explained by George Metzger followed by a question and answer period recapped below:

- Q: Mr. Sacco: Is there a projected price tag?
- A: Yes and that will come up in a later discussion
- Q: Mr. Skomro: Does MSBA have a problem with the numbers, if the space requirements are different?
- A: Yes and No, if our numbers are smaller then their allowance No, if we are larger then we have to be prepared with an explanation which they may consider, the MSBA are fairly supportive of the communities. Within a month there should be notification if any of the spaces may not be eligible
- Q: Mr. Sacco: What areas are usually not eligible?

- A: areas such as Central administration, community spaces that are not curriculum based
- Q: Even though the Black Box is going to be used as a class room, using it for community outreach and rental would that create a problem?
- A: (Tina), as long as it is Curriculum based and used as a class room it should not be a problem but Mr. Macero will look into it.
- Q: Tony Evangelista asked for clarification of the enrollment figures used to determine student/space ratio, the marginal cost per space, per student
- A: George Metzger clarified the enrollment figures and explained the MSBA templates that are used as a guideline. The marginal cost per space, per student could not be answered at this time but combining the two schools would be the most cost effective.

Other Areas that they look at are Special Education, but that is unique and each town is different.

Since there was no further discussion

Motion by Barbara Flavin to approve the Proposed Space Summary Plan

Second by Mary Lou Osborne

Vote: Unanimous

Peter Gill: Motion to Affirm the Propose Space Summary Plan as voted on by the School Building Assistance Committee

Mr. Sacco questioned whether this affirmation meant that this eliminated the possibility of other choices if the MSBA did not like our initial proposal. Tina explained that this was like negotiations, the MSBA would come back to us with information that the committee would then reexamine to meet our needs and fall with in the guidelines.

Mr. Sacco then second the motion

No further discussions

Vote to Affirm:

Unanimous

Preliminary Review of Evaluation of Alternatives:

Tina explained the Base line that the MSBA requires and Options1, A, B, C, D, and E (handouts on file)

Questions pertaining to the costs of construction, new versus renovation

Possibility of closing streets

Moving students during construction

Time line

Reimbursement Rates

Blending of two Options

Parking were all addressed, but it is still too early in the project to have conclusive answers to any of the above areas

MaryLou: Would MSBA allow us to build on a flood plain?

HMFH: They would probably want you to have all the permits first but would want to know if there were other sites available.

Other topics that were raised:

- Three story building (our present elementary schools are three stories and the present Boston Latin is five stories), MSBA does not have issues with multi story construction
- Issues involved if we had to move Students during constructions/possibility of half days/modules, John Macero, Superintendent of Schools has been looking into all the various scenarios and which would be least disruptive for students and families, and most cost effective
- Maintenance of new building/Mr. McKenna: the town has hired a Facilities manager and recently an electrician and is continuing to look in that direction for maintenance purposes school buildings and all town buildings

With no further questions Dave explained the voting while Mary Lou handed out a tally sheet (on file) to each School Building Assistance Committee Member (who was present) in order to rank their choice which will then be presented to the MSBA (in order of rank) The individual tally sheets were only worksheets. Members were polled individually and verbally gave rankings of their top three options and Mary Lou maintained the official tally.

. Before the actual voting, Mary Lou asked to read a letter (letter on file) from Jim Letterie, School Committee Member, who was not present. She was granted that permission and did say that his preference would not be counted since he was not in attendance.

Tally was taken: Results were as follows:

Each member could rank their top vote 3 points, second choice 2 points, third choice 1 point or choose not to give more than one or two choices

Option 1:	0 votes
Option A:	27 votes
Option B:	38 votes
Option C:	1 vote
Option D:	8 votes
Option E:	0 votes

The results were read:

Option B was ranked as number 1, Option A was ranked as Number 2 and option D was ranked as Number 3.

MaryLou Osborn made a **motion to approve the submission of these feasibility study options to the MSBA on behalf of School Building Committee**
Second by Barbara Flavin

Open for discussion

George Metzger approached the Committee Chairman to point out an error in calculations to the spreadsheet (Winthrop High School Draft Cost Estimate for Options on file) which changed the bottom line figures for the Town for option C and E.

Result: David felt that there need to be a voice call with the committee members to review, change or confirm their votes. Mary Lou asked that HMFH go over the entire sheet and get back to us if there were any other discrepancies found.

A verbal check was conducted, each member was re-pollled, votes were confirmed, and the results remained the same.

Motion was amended by Ms Osborne to include the results of the tally

Seconded by Barbara Flavin

No further discussion

Vote:

Unanimous

School Committee Member: **Peter Gill made a motion to affirm the vote by the School Committee Assistance Committee on ranked options**

Second by Todd Sacco

No Discussion

Vote:

Unanimous

Motion to Adjourn Barbara Flavin

Second: Karin Chavis

Respectfully

School Building Assistance Committee Minutes

Judi Buono

Secretary

Handouts:

- Winthrop High School School Building Project,

- Proposed Space Summary

- Winthrop High School-Draft Cost Estimate for Options

- Tally Sheet for Ranking Options, votes noted

- Letter from Jim Letterie

- Conclusions (Pros and Cons for options)

- Preliminary Evaluation of Alternatives

- Color Copies of Options A-E including site plan